Chapter Title	Xenophon's Philosophy of Management	
Copyright Year	2019	
Copyright Holder	Springer Nature Switzerland	AG
Corresponding Author	Family Name	Blok
	Particle	
	Given Name	Vincent
	Suffix	
	Organization/University	Wageningen University
	City	Wageningen
	Country	The Netherlands
	Email	vincent.blok@wur.nl
	In this chapter, we explore Xenophon's philosophy of management ar identify nine dimensions of business management, as well as th competencies (the knowledge, skills, and virtues) that good management requires. The scientific contribution of this chapter does not only consi in the fact that this is the first publications in which Xenophon philosophy of management is systematically analyzed. Historic analysis can also help to question the self-evidence of our contemporat conceptualization of management. Xenophon's philosophy of management enables us to criticize the contemporary focus on prof maximization and to articulate an intrinsic relation between busines and society; to criticize the contemporary disconnectedness of busines management and to develop a broader set of individual competencies ar know-how that is required for business managers; to criticize the contemporary focus on management and control; and to rehabilitate th role of business management as ability and capacity that involves know how, actual engagement, and virtuous competencies. Finally, this concept of management challenges contemporary conceptualizations of th differences between private and public management in politic philosophical debates.	
Keywords (separated by "-")	Xenophon - Philosophy of m	anagement - Management - Virtue - Control

Metadata of the chapter that will be visualized online

Xenophon's Philosophy of Management

2 Vincent Blok

3 Contents

0		
4	Introduction	2
5	Nine Dimensions of Business Management According to Xenophon	3
6	Key Requirements of Business Managers According to Xenophon	10
7	Knowledge Involved in Management Practices	12
8	Skills Involved in Management Practices	14
9	Virtues Involved in Business Management	14
10	Discussion and Conclusion	15
11	Cross-References	
12	References	19

13 Abstract

In this chapter, we explore Xenophon's philosophy of management and identify 14 nine dimensions of business management, as well as the competencies (the 15 knowledge, skills, and virtues) that good management requires. The scientific 16 contribution of this chapter does not only consist in the fact that this is the first 17 publications in which Xenophon's philosophy of management is systematically 18 analyzed. Historical analysis can also help to question the self-evidence of our 19 contemporary conceptualization of management. Xenophon's philosophy of 20 management enables us to criticize the contemporary focus on profit maximiza-21 tion and to articulate an intrinsic relation between business and society; to 22 criticize the contemporary disconnectedness of business management and to 23 develop a broader set of individual competencies and know-how that is required 24 for business managers; to criticize the contemporary focus on management and 25 control; and to rehabilitate the role of business management as ability and 26 capacity that involves know-how, actual engagement, and virtuous competencies. 27

V. Blok (🖂)

AU1 Wageningen University, Wageningen, The Netherlands e-mail: vincent.blok@wur.nl

[©] Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2019

C. Neesham, S. Segal (eds.), *Handbook of Philosophy of Management*, Handbooks in Philosophy, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-48352-8_27-1

Finally, this concept of management challenges contemporary conceptualizations
 of the differences between private and public management in political philosoph ical debates.

31	Keywords			
32	Xenophon · Ph	nilosophy of managemen	t · Management ·	· Virtue · Control

33 Introduction

In philosophy of management, there is a relatively lack of interest in the history of 34 the concept. For instance, in the first volume of the *Philosophy of management* 35 journal, Alan Bray raised the provocative question "Why is it that management 36 seems to have no history?" indicating that the practice of management as a corpus of 37 knowledge and skills received only little attention in the literature (Bray 2001). 38 While in the second volume, Fontrodona and Melé propose Aristotelian philosophy 39 as a theoretical foundation of management (Fontrodona and Melé 2002), the history 40 of philosophies of management is relatively absent in subsequent volumes.¹ With 41 this, I do not mean that philosophers are not explored to reflect on issues in 42 management. On the contrary, philosophy of management has a strong tradition in 43 applying ideas of philosophers to management issues, like Stoic ideas on ethics of 44 management (Bowden 2012), Aristotle's ideas on corporate responsibility and 45 management practice (Gimbel 2005; Hartman 2015), Dewey's ideas on innovation 46 management (Bordum 2007), Levinas' ideas on whistleblowing (Loumansky and 47 Lewis 2013), or Heidegger's ideas on leadership (Krentz and Malloy 2005). But 48 these ideas of the big names of the philosophical tradition are often not further 49 developed into a full fletched philosophy of management of Aristotle, Heidegger, or 50 Levinas. This seems to be legitimate, as these philosophers themselves often did not 51 develop an explicit philosophy of management themselves. 52

There seems to be at least one exception in the history of philosophy, namely Xenophon, who can be seen as the first philosopher that reflected systematically on the concept of business management. In *Oeconomicus*, published around 385 B.C., Xenophon introduces a dialogue between Socrates and Critobulus, a wealthy young man, and Ischomachus, a noble and successful manager, about economy.² *Oikonomia*, as Xenophon understood it, is far removed from our contemporary understanding of economics and is primarily concerned with household

¹In fact, interest in the history of the concept of management is more often found outside the particular subdomain of philosophy of management, for instance, Mondzain (2005) and Agamben (2007).

²At first sight, it seems to be strange to consult Socrates' vision on business management, as he is normally seen as very negative about profit making and business (Plato 2013). Because the historical comparison between the Socrates of Plato and Xenophon is beyond the scope of this chapter, we purely focus on Socrates contribution to the question what is (business) management as it appears in Xenophon's *Oeconomicus* in this chapter.

management (Deslandes 2018). The fact that *oikonomia* originally concerns house-60 hold management, rather than economics, may also explain why economists are 61 often hesitant to read Xenophon as an economist (Lowry 1979). The domain of the 62 household is not limited to the private sphere of the house in which we live but 63 extents to all property that enables the owner of the household to make a living. 64 This legitimizes us to take Xenophon's philosophical reflections on household 65 management as a philosophy of business management. In this chapter, we 66 explore Xenophon's philosophy of management and identify nine dimensions of 67 management (1) and the knowledge, skills, and virtues that good management 68 requires (2). 60

While general philosophical studies of Xenophon's Oeconomicus provided 70 already insightful interpretations of his work (Strauss 1989), the scientific contribu-71 tion of this chapter consists in the fact that, to the best of my knowledge, this is the 72 first publication in which Xenophon's philosophy of management is systematically 73 analyzed from the perspective of business management. Historical analysis can also 74 help to question the self-evidence of our contemporary conceptualization of man-75 agement, and to explore new directions in our conceptualization of management, as 76 we will explore in section three. It also challenges contemporary conceptualizations 77 of the differences between private and public management in political philosophical 78 debates. This is the second scientific contribution of this chapter. 79

Nine Dimensions of Business Management According to Xenophon

One of the first philosophical conceptualizations of management occurred in the 82 work of Xenophon. In the *Oeconomicus*, business management concerns the totality 83 of the assets of the owner. Although these assets are a necessary condition to make a 84 living, it is not a sufficient condition as these assets have to be managed in order to 85 become profitable and generate wealth for the owner (Xenophon 2013: 1.15; 86 3.1-3.3). What are the main dimensions of business management that can be 87 found in Xenophon's work? In our reflections on the nature of business management, 88 we have to abandon the contextual factors that can be found in Xenophon's work, as 89 he lived in an agricultural society and in a period where management mainly 90 concerned the management of slaves. 91

Business management concerns the functional order and ordered arrangement of the business that is led by a superintendent (*episkopos*) that is in control of the business, even in case of accidents and unforeseen situations, so that it's ordered functioning is guaranteed and maintained. This control of the manager is compared with a ship:

Now I saw this man in his spare time inspecting everything that is needed as a matter of
course on the ship. I was surprised to see him looking them over and asked what he was
doing. 'Sir', he answered, 'I am looking to see how the ship's equipment is stored, in case of
any accident, or whether anything is missing or mixed up with other equipment'. (Xenophon
2013: 8.15–16)

Business management is understood here as the establishment of a functioning 102 order in which all natural resources have their proper place, all human resources have 103 their proper task and role³, and the business manager regulates and governs the 104 proper use of these natural and human resources in order to make profit. This 105 involves the structuring of the business and the assignment of an appropriate place 106 to each part of the business. Xenophon speaks about grain that has to remain dry and 107 wine that has to remain cool, but we can extent this to the appropriate design of the 108 production and distribution process of a business, the structure of business units, etc. 109 Next, it concerns the placement of employees in this functioning order. The first 110 dimension of business management that we can discern is the establishment and 111 maintenance of a functioning order of the business in order to make profit. 112

A second dimension of business management occurs if we consider the ordered 113 functioning of the ship we encountered before. In first instance, the establishment 114 and maintenance of a functioning order of the business enables the manager to act 115 appropriately in times of setback or unforeseen circumstances that threaten the 116 survival of the ship in stormy weather. But another aspect of this functioning order 117 is that it constitutes a "paradise" of beauty that evokes admiration (Xenophon 2013: 118 4.13; 4.21). We can think of Xenophon's example of the ship in which all equipment 119 is well stored – e.g., rope is not lying around but well-ordered and organized – and 120 that provides peace of mind and energy to work in, but we can easily extend this 121 example to well-established organization structures in which all disparate tasks and 122 roles work together as one (Xenophon 2013: 8.7). Xenophon provides the example 123 of a chorus: 124

A chorus is a combination of people; but when its members do as they please, it becomes mere confusion, and there is no pleasure in watching it; but when they move and sing in an orderly fashion, then those same people at once seem worth watching and worth hearing. (Xenophon 2013: 8.3)

This order is not only a functional order but evokes admiration because of its beauty 129 - everything is more beautiful when set out in order according to Xenophon (2013: 130 (8.20) – and nothing is so good for human beings as order (Xenophon 2013: 8.3). It is 131 important to acknowledge that for the Greeks, the beautiful does not only has 132 aesthetic but also moral significance. The second dimension of business manage-133 ment that we discern is that the manager establishes and maintains the functioning 134 order of the business in such a way that its (beautiful) order evokes public 135 admiration. 136

A third dimension of business management is that the ordered functioning of the business does not only serve the private interests of the owner of the business -e.g.,

³Although Xenophon himself explicitly talks about slaves, we conceive the term in more neutral terms as subordinates. On the one hand, Xenophon's description of the role and treatment of slaves resonates with modern ways of treating employees as we will see. On the other, both slaves and employees can be formally seen as subordinates of the business manager who is the owner of the assets.

5

a grand harvest – but also the public interest of society. A farm does not only provide
food and luxury by which people live and enjoy their live but also the environment in
which public services can be practiced. Xenophon provides the example of agriculture that enables man to work on the land *and* prepare them to defend the state:

She gives increased strength through exercise to those who labour with their own hands, and hardens the overseers of the work by rousing them early and forcing them to move about briskly. For on a farm no less than in the city the most important operations have their fixed time. Again, if a man wants to defend his city by serving in the cavalry, farming is his most efficient partner in furnishing upkeep for this horse; if in the infantry, it energizes his body. (Xenophon 2013: 5.4–5; 11.17)

We can easily abstract from this particular context and argue that management 149 establishes a functioning order that serves simultaneously private - sales of food 150 products – and public purposes – serving a healthy society by promoting a healthy 151 lifestyle. In the end, business management is not a goal in itself but should enable the 152 business manager to serve the interests of his friends and the state according to 153 Xenophon (2013: 6.9).⁴ Only those who serve the state and are loyal to society are 154 held in the highest esteem by the state (Xenophon 2013: 6.10). The third dimension 155 of business management that we can discern is that the business manager establishes 156 and maintains the functioning order of the business in such a way that it integrates 157 public and private interests. 158

In order to establish and maintain the functioning order of the business, the 159 manager has to engage in the business operations himself via direct labor according 160 to Xenophon. This seems to be strange for a business owner in the Greek context, as 161 labor is scorned and held in low regard in ancient Greece (Xenophon 2013: 4.2). But 162 Xenophon is more positive about direct engagement in the business operations of the 163 business manager via direct labor – planting, for instance (Xenophon 2013: 4.22–24) 164 - as it contributes to their happiness as purpose of life (eudaimonia) (Xenophon 165 2013: 4.25). The joy of direct labor provides satisfaction and self-confidence, as their 166 mastery in the production of the products and services that the business provides 167 matures.⁵ Another aspect of the positive assessment of direct labor may be the 168 double purpose of business operations that we encountered before, for instance, 169 farming (private interest) and preparing to defend the state (public interest). One 170 other important reason for direct involvement in labor is that an important task of 171 managers is to teach their employees, which requires know-how as we will see. 172 Here, direct labor is not a goal in itself but serves the manager's aim to fulfil his role 173

⁴Throughout this chapter, he or his can be replaced by she or her.

⁵While historically, direct labour is primarily associated with pain and suffering, Xenophon associates it with joy and pleasure. This may be explained by the fact that he, as business manager, is *free* to engage in direct labour while his employees are *necessitated* to engage in direct labour in order to survive. This may also explain why Karl Marx criticized Xenophon's "characteristic, bourgeois instinct" (cited in Strauss 1989: 203). At the same time, we could argue that Xenophon's appreciation of direct labour helps us to criticize the disconnection between the workforce and the management level that can often be observed in contemporary bureaucratic organizations (see §3).

as business manager and his role as public servant. The fourth dimension of business
management is the involvement of the manager in the business operations via direct
labor.

The fifth dimension of business management concerns the manager's engagement in the business operations via the work of other people, i.e., the management of his subordinates to perform all roles and tasks in a proper way. His task is to give subordinates a proper role and task and manage them in such a way that they are not imprisoned and enforced to perform their task in a proper way, but that they are free and willing to work for the business manager (Xenophon 2013: 3.4).

At a first level, he has to cooperate with his wife in order to become successful according to Xenophon. Although Xenophon argues that the business manager has to instruct his wife in the right way of doing things (Xenophon 2013: 3.11), and with this, may make the impression that he sees his wife merely as subordinate like Aristotle⁶, it is clear that Xenophon is in fact very positive about the role of the wife in business management and that he stresses cooperation and partnership with her in growing the business:

I think that the wife who is a good partner in the household contributes just as much as her husband to its good; because the income for the most part is the result of the husband's exertions, but the expenses are controlled mostly by the wife's management. If both do their part well, the estate is increased; if they act incompetently, it is diminished. (Xenophon 2013: 3.15)

If we abstract from classical role models, we can argue that Xenophon highlights 195 here that the business manager cannot maintain the functioning order of the business 196 all by himsel: \mathbb{B} cause he is focusing on sales, for instance, he needs first of all to 197 cooperate and partner up with other managers who manage expenses. The mainte-198 nance of the functioning order of a profitable business requires a team of managers 199 that "mutually service" (Xenophon 2013: 7.19) each other and form a partnership, 200 balancing income and expenses, external and internal affairs, etc. As it is clear that 201 for Xenophon, the wife contributes equally to the success of the business, we can 202 abandon his literal connection of males as manager of the external affairs and 203 females as managers of the internal affairs (Xenophon 2013: 7.20-7.26) and high-204 light the functional difference between the management of income, for instance, 205 marketing and sales, and the management of expenses, for instance, procurement. 206 Next to performing his or her own specific role as manager of income or expenses, 207 for instance, the manager has to manage a management team together with other 208 managers in order to make the business profitable. The management of a manage-209 ment team is the first level of engagement of the business manager with business 210 operations via the work of other people. 211

At a second level, the business manager has to establish a management system because he cannot control everything himself, for instance, in case of other branches

⁶According to Aristotle, females are naturally subordinate because of their limited rationality (Aristotle 1944: 1260a9-15).

of the business that are not under his direct control. One way to maintain the 214 functioning order of the business is by establishing internal rules and regulations 215 that all employees have to comply with, for instance, maxims and governance 216 procedures that safeguard right behavior. Xenophon provides examples like "thieves 217 shall be punished for their thefts" (Xenophon 2013: 14.5), but we can easily abstract 218 from these examples and extent it to other and also more positive core values of a 219 company like honesty and integrity. It is interesting to observe that Xenophon 220 focusses on the content of these rules, for instance, that the maxim we just mentioned 221 makes greed unprofitable to the offender and benefits the upright employee 222 (Xenophon 2013: 14.6). 223

At a third level, the business manager maintains the functioning order of the 224 business by assigning proper roles to trusted middle managers that send him reports 225 about their business performance, and that can perform the management tasks in the 226 name of the business manager. This middle manager should have the same personal 227 characteristics as the business manager as owner of the assets, for instance, self-228 control and eagerness to improve the business (Xenophon 2013: 9.11–12; 14.1)) 229 (see §2 for the further discussion of the competencies of the manager). The business 230 manager is the superintendent that oversees and governs the middle managers so that 231 they adhere to the arrangement of tasks and roles, and inspects the performance of 232 the business (Xenophon 2013: 9.14-15; 14.1). Like the business manager oversees 233 and governs the middle managers, the middle managers oversee and govern the 234 employees. Also these middle managers are seen as partners of the business 235 manager: 236

We also taught her to be loyal to us by making her a partner in all our joys and, if we had any trouble, inviting her to share that too. We trained her to be eager for the improvement of our estate by making her familiar with it and by allowing her to share in our success. And we developed in her a sense of justice by giving more honour to the just than to the unjust, and by showing her that the just live in greater wealth and freedom than the unjust. (Xenophon 2013: 9.12)

A key task of the business manager is to select the middle managers who are 243 attentive to the business affairs. He selects those who have a passion for making 244 money and have a desire to win the approbation of the business manager (Xenophon 245 2013:14.9) and avoids those who are hard drinkers, sluggards, fall desperately in 246 love (Xenophon 2013: 12.11-15), and remain dishonest even though they are well 247 treated. He has also to review the performance of the middle managers and to reward 248 high performance and to honor them, and to punish low performance. It is important 249 to see that for Xenophon, reward does not only consist in the provision of monetary 250 rewards but also in the promotion of good performing middle managers in the scale 251 of honors (Xenophon 2013: 4.7). This can be done formally via promotions in rank, 252 but also informally by giving trust, by entrusting an important task, and by providing 253 honor to particular employees. 254

This does not mean however that the business manager can delegate all roles and tasks to the middle management. According to Xenophon, as the business manager experiences best the profits of good management and the losses of bad management, some management tasks can only be performed properly by the business manager himself or another member of the management team, and cannot be delegated to the middle managers or employees. Although Xenophon does not provide examples, we can think of management decisions that can have a major impact on the profit and loss of the business.

One can negatively argue that the principle-agent problem explains why the 263 business manager cannot delegate all management tasks to the middle managers, 264 e.g., that the business manager as owner of the assets (principle) can never be sure 265 whether the middle manager (agent) will act in his best interest or will be tempted to 266 serve his own interests instead. More positively formulated, however, one can also 267 argue that the business manager cannot delegate all management tasks to the middle 268 managers because of the considerable importance of teaching and training, as we 269 have seen. This requires his leading by example and therefore, his direct engagement 270 in the business operations anyway. This brings a fourth level of engagement with the 271 business operation via the work of other people to light, namely people management 272 of the employees of the branches that are under his direct control. At this level, 273 management consists in leading subordinates in such a way that they obey willingly 274 and contribute to the profitability of the business, instead of running away in times of 275 setback (Xenophon 2013: 3.4; 4.19). This requires not only the ability to manage 276 inflowing and outflowing streams of resources, to superintend the value adding 277 process performed by employees, but also rewarding good behavior and punishment 278 of employees who are misbehaving (Xenophon 2013: 7.42). Rewarding employees 279 does not only consist in monetary rewards, but also in showing that being obedient is 280 more advantageous for the employees, and by providing particular rewards that are 281 valuable for the individual employees; the one who loves nice cloth is more 282 rewarded by a nice robe according Xenophon (2013: 13.6–9). Furthermore, it also 283 involves a differentiation in rewarding, by providing the better employee with 284 superior gifts. Direct people management also involves the skill to care for the 285 employees (Xenophon, 7.37), as those who are cared for feel grateful and more 286 loyal. As a consequence, the employees will follow the business manager and serve 287 his interests. And according to Xenophon, this ability to lead employees that are 288 willing to follow constitutes a good manager': 289

Those you may justly call high-minded who have many followers of like mind; and with reason may he be said to march 'with a strong arm' whose will many an arm is ready to serve; and truly great is he who can do great deeds by will rather than by strength. So too in private enterprises, the man in authority – foreman or manager – who can make the workers eager, industrious, and persevering – he is the man who gives a lift to the business and swell the surplus... But if at the sight of him they stir themselves and a spirit of determination and

⁷Xenophon wrote another book on leadership, based on his experience of a military campaign in which the Greeks fled for the Persians by fighting their way back to Greece (Xenophon 1989). Although there are several overlaps between Xenophon's *Oeconomicus* and *Anabalis*, a further comparison between the two works is beyond the scope of this chapter, which focusses on business management in general and not on leadership only. See for an analysis of Xenophon's concept of leadership, Humphreys (2002).

9

rivalry and eagerness to excel falls on every workman, then I should say: this man has a touch of the kingly nature in him. (Xenophon 2013: 21.8–10)

As said, the direct engagement in people management is not a purpose in itself but 298 establishes the know-how of the business manager that enables him to teach the 299 middle management. The middle manager cannot learn to be a good superintendent 300 if the teacher (the business manager) himself models inattentiveness according to 301 Xenophon (2013: 12.18–19). It is primarily "the master's eye" that makes the middle 302 manager good (Xenophon 2013: 12.20), and this requires at least some direct 303 engagement in the actual business operations of the business manager. With this, a 304 sixth dimension of business management emerges, namely training and teaching of 305 employees and middle managers. The business manager has to manage his sub-306 ordinates by teaching them how to perform particular skills well, such as producing a 307 grand harvest, making bread out of grain, cloth out of wool, to superintend and take 308 care of the business. We can easily abstract from Xenophon's examples of the 309 agricultural sector and extent it to any value adding process in business life. By 310 teaching an employee how to make cloth from wool, for instance, the manager 311 doubles the value of the employee because he is able to add more value by making 312 cloth from wool, than only the production of wool, for instance (Xenophon 2013: 313 7.41). Teaching also concern teaching of loyalty to the business manager, although 314 loyalty is best learned by rewarding those who contribute to the prosperity of the 315 business. 316

Although the business manager establishes and maintains a functioning order of 317 the business, Xenophon acknowledges the fundamental role of risk and misfortune. 318 However well the functioning order of the business is established and managed, 319 foresight of future affairs is fundamentally limited, and it is always possible that 320 unforeseen circumstances occur. On the one hand, the emergence of unforeseen 321 circumstances explains why a business needs a well-managed functioning order, in 322 which all employees blindly know where to find equipment and resources to 323 adequately address challenges, like a ship that is assaulted by a hailstorm. We can 324 easily abstract from Xenophon's examples of hailstorms and frosts that impact 325 agricultural practice, and argue that managers have to deal with imperfect foresight 326 and contingency. On the other hand, although the establishment of a functioning 327 order helps to manage the business well in case of an accident, Xenophon acknowl-328 edges the fundamental limitation of the role of management. In the context of Greek 329 society, this acknowledgment leads to management practices to propitiate the Gods 330 and to ask the blessing of the Gods before engaging in business operations (Xeno-331 phon, 5.19-20). This acknowledgment of the fundamental limitation of the role of 332 management of the functioning order of a business is the seventh dimension of 333 business management. 334

The eighth dimension of business management concerns the extension of the business by proper asset management. Proper asset management, on the one hand, prevents that all assets are fixed in buildings, etc. and are therefore not available and usable to make a profit or that these assets are out of direct control (for instance, in foreign countries) but instead are arranged carefully in the proper place and managed to make profit (Xenophon 2013: 3.3). On the other, asset management consists in the
acquisition of new low performing sites and to make them profitable in order to sell
them later on for a higher price, next to autonomous growth of the business via good
management practices. It is important to notice that the purpose of these acquisitions
is not only to make profit but also for reasons of pleasure:

'Well farmed land', he would say, 'costs a lot and can't be improved;' and he said that where
there is no room for improvement there is not much pleasure to be got from the land: landed
estate and livestock must be continually improving to give the fullest measure of satisfaction.
(Xenophon 2013: 20.23)

But the aim of business management is not to increase property as such. The aim of 349 business is to satisfy the wants of the business manager (Xenophon 2013: 2.4) and to 350 serve his friends and the state: "Surely those who can maintain their own estate and 351 yet have enough left to adorn the city and relieve their friends may well be thought 352 affluent and powerful man" (Xenophon 2013: 11.10). And even when Xenophon 353 seems to suggest that the increase of property is a purpose in itself, this increase is 354 limited by the condition of self-control, which prevents greed and impulsive behav-355 ior, by the condition of fairness and honorability (Xenophon 2013: 7.15; 11.8), and 356 by the condition of providing pleasure. The ninth and last dimension of business 357 management is therefore that management is conditioned by the human needs of the 358 business manager as owner of the assets on the one hand, which may be different for 359 each individual manager (Xenophon 2013: 2.4), and by his service to society on the 360 other.⁸ Xenophon provides examples like the entertainment of foreign guests, 361 playing the benefactor to the citizens and contributing to the defense of the state 362 (Xenophon 2013: 3.6), but we can easily generalize these examples toward a serving 363 role of business to society. According to Xenophon, those business managers who 364 cannot afford these services will be punished by the public (Xenophon 2013: 2.7). 365 In the table below, we summarize the nine dimensions of business management 366

that we encountered in Xenophon's work in this section (Table 1).

368 Key Requirements of Business Managers According to Xenophon

After having identified the key dimensions of business management according to Xenophon, we can also identify the key personal characteristics of the business manager. Although management is a branch of knowledge (*episteme*) according to Xenophon (2013: 1.1), it in fact concerns the *practice* to employ the assets – arable land, for instance – in a particular spatial-temporal context and in such a way that they become profitable – provide a rich harvest, for instance. Business management

 $_{375}$ then does not only involve knowledge – e.g., understanding the "what" of farming –

⁸Xenophon is against profit maximization as such and his notion of the limitation of the economic sphere by the political sphere resembles Aristotle's conceptualization in this respect (Aristotle 1944). The further comparison between Aristotle and Xenophon is beyond the scope of this chapter.

- t.2 1. Management concerns the establishment and maintenance of a functioning order of the business in order to make profit.
- t.3 2. Management concerns the establishment and maintenance of a functioning order of the business in order to evoke public admiration.
- t.4 3. The establishment and maintenance of a functioning order of the business serves both private and public interests in an integrated way
- t.5 4. Management consists in the engagement of the business manager in the business operations via direct labor.
- t.6 5. Management consists in the engagement of the business manager in the business operations via the work done by other people
 - (a) Collaboration and partnership with other business managers in a management team
 - (b) Establishment of a management system with internal rules and regulations that employees have to comply with
 - (c) Assigning proper roles to trusted middle managers
 - (d) Direct people management of employees and/or middle managers
- t.7 6. Management consists in training and teaching of employees and/or middle managers
- t.8 7. Management acknowledges the fundamental limitations of the establishment and maintenance of the functioning order of the business, and acknowledges the fundamental role of risk and misfortune
- t.9 8. Management consists in proper asset management in order to increase profit and pleasure.
- t.10 9. Management consists in proper asset management in order to serve society

but also skills - e.g., understanding the "how" and "when" of farming (Xenophon 376 2013:15.8) – as well as the right virtues to successfully operate as a farmer and 377 produce a grand harvest - e.g., being attentive and able to govern employees, for 378 instance (Xenophon 2013: 15.5). Just like knowledge and skills, also these virtues 379 are a necessary condition of successful business management according to 380 Xenophon. He identified various virtues of the business manager, for instance, 381 eagerness (in opposition with unwillingness), diligence (in opposite to idleness), 382 moral courage (in opposite to moral cowardice) care (in opposite to negligence), and 383 self-control (in opposite to gambling and consorting with bad companions) (Xeno-384 phon 2013: 1.16–1.20). 385

In modern language, we can frame these three components of knowledge, skills, and virtues in terms of the individual *competencies* to use the assets of the business in a particular context and situation (cf. Blok et al. 2016), so the combination of knowledge (*episteme*), virtue (*arête*), and skills (*technè*) that enables an individual

11

³⁹⁰ business manager to fulfil his tasks successfully.⁹ We will discuss now the three ³⁹¹ components of these individual competencies of business managers as we can find ³⁹² them in Xenophon's work.

393 Knowledge Involved in Management Practices

Xenophon argues that business management concerns a branch of knowledge by which business managers can increase their business (Xenophon 2013: 6.4). A first part of this knowledge concerns the knowledge as described by the nine dimensions how to establish and maintain the functioning order of the business. Business management builds in this respect a field of knowledge as the manager has to understand the job and how and when to do it. Otherwise, a doctor could do the job of a manager as well (Xenophon 2013: 13.2).

This knowledge of business management is required for three reasons: first, this 401 knowledge enables the business manager to engage in various dimensions of 402 business operations himself (dimensions 1, 2, 3, 7, 8, 9). Second, this knowledge 403 enables the business manager to manage the middle managers and employees 404 (dimension 5). Only a manager who has knowledge about the what, how, and 405 when can govern his middle managers and employees in a proper way according 406 to Xenophon: "The greatest lesson to learn is how each job ought to be done; and 407 you added that if a man doesn't know what to do and how to do it, no good can come 408 of his management" (Xenophon 2013: 15.2). Third, this knowledge is required to 409 enable the business manager to teach and train the middle managers: 410

Of course I try to train them myself, Socrates. For the man has to be capable of taking charge
in my absence; so why need he know anything but what I know myself? For if I am fit to
manage the farm, I presume I can teach another man what I know myself. (Xenophon 2013:
12.4)

A second layer of knowledge concerns the sector-specific expert knowledge of the domain in which the business manager is operating, e.g., the what, how, and when of farming (Xenophon 2013: 15.6). This is required for two reasons. First, this knowledge enables him to engage in the business operations via direct labor himself (dimension 4). Secondly, a large part of the work of the business manager consists in teaching, for instance, teaching how to generate a grand harvest in farming. This requires the business manager to have particular expert knowledge about farming,

⁹Framing the particular *episteme* involved in business management in terms of individual competency solves an interpretation problem (Bragues 2007), as Xenophon calls management an *episteme* and a *technè* in this book, and is actually consulting a good practitioner in management in the second half of the book, and is not only looking for universals or ideas that can be applied in different cases of business management. Although Agamben is right in his observation that management is less epistemic and more a way of being (Agamben 2007: 17), he misses this threefold notion of competency as a combination of *episteme, arête* and *technè*.

for instance (Xenophon 2013: 7.41). Only if the manager knows what, how, and 422 when to do farming, i.e., when his mastery of farming is established and matured, he 423 is able to teach and manage employees that are involved in farming practices 424 (dimension 6). In this respect, his mastery of the products and services that are 425 produced by the business comes first and is primary, while his mastery of his 426 employees is secondary. At the same time, the manager should be open to learn 427 from others as well, even his employees: "Stand before the loom and be ready to 428 instruct those who know less than you, and to learn from those who know more" 429 (Xenophon 2013: 10.10). 430

Xenophon explores the knowledge that is required for farming, for instance, 431 knowledge about the nature of the soil as fertile soil for the produce, the particular 432 plants that can grow properly in a particular region, the right time for sowing and 433 reaping, given the nature of the soil and the local climate. This indicates that the 434 knowledge that is required is not only the knowledge of the what (theoretical 435 knowledge) but also knowledge of the when and how (practical knowledge) that is 436 developed through practice. This sector-specific expert knowledge holds for the 437 what, how, and when of farming but is different in each specific sector. 438

Another aspect of this practical knowledge is that it is combined with action. 439 Xenophon indicates that many people may know, for instance, the best way of 440 marching in formation through an enemy's country, but that only a few carry it out 441 accordingly. The good manager does not only have knowledge about what ought to 442 be done in a specific situation but also takes care that it is actually done this way 443 (Xenophon 2013: 20.14). Xenophon calls this attentiveness (Xenophon 2013: 20.6), 444 a competency that clearly resonates with the modern competency of action compe-445 tence, i.e., the ability to actually take responsibility (Blok et al. 2016). Attentiveness 446 is characterized by the ability to oversee the work that has to be done and by taking 447 care that the business operations are actually effectuated according to the planning, 448 by planning the work and by effectuating it accordingly (Xenophon 2013: 20.18). 449

A further cognitive aspect is the ability of the business manager to acknowledge 450 the limitations of his individual competencies, and the acknowledgment of roles and 451 tasks of other members of the management team that have to be balanced in order to 452 maintain the functioning order of the business. There are different roles that have to 453 be played in the business and the perfect balance and partnership can be threatened if 454 one of the managers is only focusing on his own role or task, neglecting the 455 importance of the others. "But because both must give and take," good managers 456 are characterized by "memory and attention" (Xenophon 2013: 7.26). Why? 457

Just because they are not equally well endowed with all the same aptitudes, they have the more need of each other, and each member of the pair is the more useful to the other, the one being competent where the other is deficient. (Xenophon 2013: 7.28)

Memory (*mneme*) is the retention of the managers' own role and task, for instance,
production, and attention (*epimeleian*) is the ability to acknowledge the importance
of the role and task of other managers to maintain a profitable business, for instance,
sales. This idea is confirmed by Xenophon's argument that the good manager

requires the power to practice self-control to acknowledge the necessary balance and partnership between the different roles and tasks to maintain a profitable business

467 (Xenophon 2013: 7.26).

468 Skills Involved in Management Practices

Xenophon repeatedly indicate particular skills of the business manager, like the 469 ability to train middle man and employees (Xenophon 2013: 5.14); the ability to 470 govern man by rewarding those subordinates who act properly and punish those who 471 are disobedient; the ability to motivate and encourage his subordinates (Xenophon 472 2013: 5.16); a large part of management concerns the skill to maintain the function-473 ing order of the business. Xenophon speaks about the manager as superintendent that 474 guards the rules and regulations of the company, inspects the business and the task 475 performance of the employees. This skill overlaps with practical knowledge and 476 constitutes manager's attentiveness. 477

478 Virtues Involved in Business Management

Throughout Xenophon's work, several virtues of the business manager are discussed. Business management requires self-control in general (Xenophon 2013: 7.15) and particular control like eagerness (in opposition with unwillingness), diligence (in opposite to idleness), moral courage (in opposite to moral cowardice), and care (in opposite of negligence) (Xenophon 2013:1.18–19). The (middle) manager should be loyal (Xenophon 2013: 12.5), avoid gambling and consorting with bad companion (Xenophon 2013: 1.20).

According to Xenophon, the good manager is characterized by the practice of 486 specific virtues, as a virtuous manager will be honored by his employees, and better 487 manages the business (Xenophon 2013: 7.43). Xenophon identifies particular vir-488 tues, like high-mindedness. Further, the manager should act in an integer way by 489 showing himself as he is and without finery because otherwise he could deceive 490 people (Xenophon 2013: 9–10). It is not a problem and even desirable if the manager 491 looks healthy because he is doing physical exercises – Xenophon refers to manage-492 ment by walking around, which also strengthen the health of the manager 493 (Xenophon 2013: 10.11-12) – but it should be real health and no finery like make-494 up, high heels, etc. to make a better impression or to pretend to be something more 495 496 than he actually is.

A final aspect of the manager's virtues is his acknowledgment that his success is 497 not only dependent on his own performance but dependent on the Gods that grant 498 prosperity to the one who knows his duties and is thoughtful and careful accordingly 499 (Xenophon 2013: 11.8). The business manager prays for health, esteem in the city 500 501 and wealth, for instance, and acts and behaves according to these prayers (Xenophon 2013: 11.8), e.g., he acts as the best possible version of himself. He honors the 502 Gods by helping his friends if they need anything and supply what the state lacks 503 (Xenophon 2013: 11.9–10). In short, the business manager acts according to the way 504

⁵⁰⁵ he wants to be seen by the Gods. We can frame these virtues in terms of integrity,⁵⁰⁶ sincerity, and modesty.

In describing the individual competencies of business managers, we do not 507 distinguish between knowledge, skills, and virtues of business managers and middle 508 managers but provide a complete list of possible knowledge, skills, and virtues that 509 are needed. Although one could expect that knowledge how to establish the func-510 tioning order of the business is more important for the business manager than for the 511 middle manager, both require people management skills, attentiveness, and virtues 512 like self-control. Xenophon is rather explicit in this, when he argues that in case a 513 business manager assigns a middle manager to perform part of the tasks in his name, 51/ the same characteristics of self-control, memory, and attention are applied to the 515 middle managers (Xenophon 2013: 9.11). 516

Another issue that has to be taken into account is that according to Xenophon, nonetheless the important role of teaching and training, this does not imply that he believes that all knowledge, skills, and virtues can be learned. People management skills, for instance, are partly a gift that is required next to teaching:

521 Mind you, I don't go so far as to say that this can be learned at sight or at a single hearing. On 522 the contrary, to acquire these powers a man needs education: he must be possessed of great 523 natural gifts; above all, he must be inspired. For I regard this gift as not altogether human but 524 divine – this power to win willing obedience: it is manifestly a gift of the gods to the true 525 votaries of self-control. (Xenophon 2013: 21.11–12)

⁵²⁶ Finally, according to Xenophon, the competencies of the business manager that are identified in the *Occonomicus* are not only applicable to *business* management but

identified in the *Oeconomicus* are not only applicable to *business* management but also to military management and political management.¹⁰ On the one hand, this shows already that business or economic management is integral part of the political management of the state (Blok 2019). On the other hand, it raises the question which of these competencies are particularly applicable on *business* management only.

In the table below, the various knowledge, skills, and virtues that can be found in Xenophon's work are summarized.

534 Discussion and Conclusion

It is striking that this early conceptualization of management resonates pretty much with the insights provided by Henry Fayol, who can be seen as the founder of management theory. According to Fayol's management theory, which is still taught today at business schools, management has five functions: planning, organizing, instruction, coordination, and control (Fayol 1949). While the first, second, and fifth function of management corresponds with the first dimension of business

¹⁰The question whether political and economic management can be reduced to each other in a general concept of management that holds for both domains, or whether the two remain separate aspects of steering is beyond the scope of this chapter (see Blok 2019).

	Xenophon		
t.2	Knowledge	Knowledge how to establish the functioning order of the business, how to manage people, etc.	
		Sector-specific expert knowledge, e.g., the what, how, and when of farming.	
		Practical knowledge to effectuate and to actually engage in the business operations.	
		Self-knowledge of the limitations of the knowledge and skills of the business	
		manager.	
t.3	Skills	Training skills	
		People management skills (e.g., reward and punishing, motivation and encouragement, taking care)	
		Maintenance skills (e.g., guarding rules and regulations, inspection)	
t.4	Virtues	Self-control, eagerness, diligence, moral courage, care, loyal, high-mindedness. Integrity, sincerity and modesty	

t.1 **Table 2** Knowledge, skills, and virtues (competencies) of business managers that can be found in Xenophon

management that we found in Xenophon's work, the third and fourth function of management corresponds with the fifth dimension we found in Xenophon's work. We can even argue that Xenophon's conception of management already moves beyond the mechanistic perspective of management that is often associated with scientific management and prefigures the people-oriented perspective that is introduced by the human relations school (Mayo 2003) (Table 2).

Xenophon's insights also resonate pretty much with contemporary definitions of 547 management, for instance, the one that can be found in the Oxford Dictionary of 548 Business and Management. Management in the verbal sense concerns the act of 549 managing an organization or a part of it in order to make most effective use of 550 available resources, and management in the substantive sense concerns the people 551 involved in these type of management activities, i.e., the directing, planning, and 552 running of the business operations (Law 2009; Statt 2004). According to this 553 dictionary, management has three main components: (1) it concerns an organiza-554 tional skill that is taught at business schools, which corresponds with the first 555 dimension of business management that we found in Xenophon's work; (2) it 556 concerns the ability to motivate subordinates, which corresponds with the fifth 557 dimension of business management that we found in Xenophon' work; (3) it has 558 an entrepreneurial sense and concerns the recognition and exploitation of new 559 business opportunities, which corresponds with the eighth dimension of business 560 management that we found in Xenophon's work. Another similarity is that manage-561 ment is generally seen as something that can be learned by training, which corre-562 563 sponds with the sixth dimension of business management that we found in Xenophon's work, although the extent to which people management can be taught 564 remains disputable, both in Xenophon and in contemporary debates (Law 2009). 565

566 At the same time, Xenophon's philosophy of management provides a new perspective on business in society. While currently, business management is mainly 567 focused on the establishment and maintenance of a functioning order of the business 568 in order to make profit (first dimension of Xenophon's concept of business manage-569 ment). Xenophon shows the intrinsic relation between business and society. 570 The aim of business management is not only to evoke public admiration (second 571 dimension of Xenophon's concept of business management), which requires that the 572 business operations both serve private and public interests in an integrated way (third 573 dimension of Xenophon's concept of business management), and that private profits 574 are partly spend to serve society (ninth dimension of Xenophon's concept of 575 business management). This concept of management challenges not only contem-576 porary conceptualizations of the differences between private and public management 577 in political philosophical debates. It also challenges current business management 578 practices that primarily aim at private interest, and their redistribution via tax 579 payment and philanthropic activities, and calls for the active engagement and 580 integration of societal interests in the business operations in order to increase 581 corporate social responsibility (CSR). CSR, seen from Xenophon's perspective, 582 should be an integral part of business management in order to evoke public admi-583 ration. We could frame public admiration in modern terms as being responsive to 584 societal needs in order to receive a social license to operate by the public. It also 585 requires that business managers integrate both private and public interests in their 586 business operations and solve tensions between economic and societal values. While 587 private interests often prevail over public interests in contemporary business man-588 agement – think of the example of the food industry that often contribute to public 589 health problems (e.g., obesity, type 2 diabetes) (Tempels et al. 2017) – Xenophon 590 challenges us to integrate private and public interests in business management -591 think, for example, of food companies that engage in food innovations for public 592 health and serve the common good (Garst et al. 2017). 593

Xenophon's concept of business management challenges contemporary concep-594 tualizations of management also, because it highlights the necessity of sector-595 specific expert knowledge and skills, and the necessity of the involvement of 596 business managers in the business operations via direct labor. This challenges 597 contemporary ideas of business management which is often characterized by a strict 598 division of labor between management as superintendent of the business operations 599 and the workforce, and by a strict division of labor between the management 600 knowledge and skills of the business manager, and sector specific or disciplinary 601

knowledge and skills of the workforce. On the one hand, this strict division of labor 602 may explain the instrumentalization of management in contemporary business 603 management, and the disconnection and distance between business management 604 and the business operations at the work floor. On the other hand, Xenophon's 605 concept of business management can help to reconnect and integrate business 606 management and execution. In this, the particular knowledge, skills, and virtues 607 that Xenophon propose may help to develop a broader set of individual competen-608 cies and know-how that is required for business managers. 609

Finally, Xenophon's concept of business management challenges contemporary 610 conceptualizations of the manager as efficient and clean power, as it is proposed by 611 traditional management science and scientific management in particular (Fayol 612 1949; Taylor 1911). Xenophon helps to acknowledge the limitations and vulnera-613 bility of business management, i.e., the fundamental role of risk and misfortune and 614 the impossibility to establish full control. There is no such thing as Taylor's "one best 615 way" to operate the business that the manager establishes and maintains. In similar 616 vein, the exploitation of new entrepreneurial business opportunities, which is inte-617 gral part of business management (Law 2009), may always turn out to fail (Blok 618 2018). This possibility fundamentally limits the ambition of business managers to 619 establish and maintain a functioning order of the business. On the one hand, this idea 620 challenges contemporary "strong" business management practices that primarily aim 621 to increase power and control (Deslandes 2018) and substantiate the so-called 622 "control societies" in the industrial age (Deleuze 1992, 1997). On the other hand, 623 the acknowledgment of failure, risk, and misfortune moves beyond the depiction of 624 the manager as the one who has full power to control, and rehabilitates the role of 625 business management as ability and capacity that involves know-how, actual 626 engagement (action), and virtuous competence.¹¹ 627

In future research, these aspects of business management have to be further explored in order to develop a full philosophy of management.¹²

630 Cross-References

- 631 Creating an Effective Business Ethics
- 632 Philosophical Anthropology and Business Ethics
- 633 ► The Role of Virtue in Good Management

¹¹In this respect, Xenophon can be seen as predecessor of Fiedler's contingency management theory, especially its acknowledgment that there is no absolute best way to manage the business, and the situational character of the management style of the manager (cf. Fiedler and Garcia 1987).

¹²I would like to thank Cristina Neesham and Marian Eabrasu for their valuable comments on an earlier draft of this chapter.

634 References

- 635 Agamben G (2007) The kingdom and the glory. Stanford University Press, Stanford
- 636 Aristotle (1944) Politics. In: Loeb classical library. Harvard University Press, Harvard
- 637 Bfor V (2018) Information asymmetries and the paradox of sustainable business models: toward an
 638 integrated theory of sustainable entrepreneurship. In: Idowu SO et al (eds) Sustainable business
 639 models: principles, promise, and practice. Springer, Dordrecht, pp 203–225
- 640 Blok V (2019) Sovereignty versus economics: philosophical reflections on the nature of corporate 641 governance in the age of global warming. Working Paper
- 642 Blok V, Gremmen B, Wesselink R (2016) Dealing with the wicked problem of sustainable
- development: the role of individual virtuous competence. Bus Prof Ethics J 23(3):297–328
- Bordum A (2007) Managing innovation potential: revisiting Plato and reading John Dewey as a
 philosopher of innovation management. Phil Manag 6(1):63–79
- Bowden H (2012) The ethics of management: a stoic perspective. Phil Manag 11(2):29–48
- Bragues G (2007) Socrates on management: an analysis of Xenophon's Oeconomicus. Working
 paper. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=997057. Accessed 11 Mar 2019
- Bray A (2001) Why is it that management seems to have no history? Phil Manag 1(1):21–25
- 650 Deleuze G (1992) Postscript on the societies of control. October 59:3–7
- 651 Deleuze G (1997) Negotiations. Columbia University Press, Columbia
- 652 Deslandes G (2018) Weak theology and organization studies. Organ Stud:1-18
- 653 Fayol H (1949) General and industrial management. Pitman & Sons, London
- Fiedler FE, Garcia JE (1987) New approaches to leadership, cognitive resources and organizational
 performance. Wiley, New York
- Fontrodona J, Melé D (2002) Philosophy as a base for management: an Aristotelian integrative
 proposal. Phil Manag 2(2):3–9
- Garst J, Blok V, Jansen L, Omta O (2017) Responsibility versus profit: the motives of food firms for
 healthy product innovation. Sustainability 9(12):2286
- Gimbel S (2005) Can corporations be morally responsible? Aristotle, stakeholders and the non-sale
 of Hershey. Phil Manag 5(3):23–30
- Hartman EM (2015) Rationality in management theory and practice: an Aristotelian perspective.
 Phil Manag 14(1):5–16
- Humphreys JH (2002) The Anabasis and lessons in leadership: Xenophon as a prototypical
 transformational leader. J Manag Res 2(3):136–146
- Krentz AA, Malloy DC (2005) Opening people to possibilities: a Heideggerian approach to
 leadership. Phil Manag 5(1):25–44
- Law E (2009) Oxford dictionary of business and management. Oxford University Press, Oxford
- 669 Loumansky A, Lewis D (2013) A Levinasian approach to whistleblowing. Phil Manag 12(3):27-48
- 670 Lowry ST (1979) Recent literature on Ancient Greek economic thought. J Econ Lit 17(1):65-86
- MacAulay M, Lawton A (2003) Misunderstanding machiavelli in management: metaphor, analogy
 and historical method. Phil Manag 3(3):17–30
- 673 Mayo GE (2003) The human problems of an industrial civilization. Routledge, London
- Mondzain MJ (2005) Image, icon, economy: the Byzantine origins of the contemporary imaginary.
 Stanford University Press, Stanford
- 676 Plato (2013) Republic, Loeb classical library. Harvard University Press, Harvard
- 677 Statt DA (2004) The Routledge dictionary of business management. Routledge, London/New York
- Strauss L (1989) Xenophon's Socratic discourse. An interpretation of the Oeconomicus.
 St. Augustine Press, Sound Bend
- 680 Taylor FW (1911) The principles of scientific management. Harper & Brothers, New York
- Tempels T, Verweij M, Blok V (2017) Big food's ambivalence: seeking profit and responsibility for
 health. Am J Public Health 107(3):402–406
- 683 Xenophon (1989) Anabasis. Loeb classical library. Harvard University Press, Harvard
- Kenophon (2013) Memorabilia, Oeconomicus, symposium, apology. Loeb classical library.
 Harvard University Press, Harvard

AU6

AU8

Index Terms:

Attentiveness 13 Business management eight' dimension of 9 fifth dimension of 6 fourth dimension of 6 ninth and last dimension of 10 second dimension of 4 seventh dimension of 9 sixth dimension of 9 third dimension of 4 virtues involved in 14-15 Xenophon's works 3-11 Critobulus 2 Knowledge 11 Oeconomicus 2 Oikonomia 2 Proper asset management 9 Skills 11 Virtue 11 Xenophon business management according to 3-10 business managers according to 10-18 as economist 3 philosophical reflections 3 philosophy of management 3

Author Queries

Chapter No.: 27-1

347069	0	En

Query Refs.	Details Required	Author's response	
AU1	Please be aware that your name and affiliation and if applicable those of you co-author(s) will be published as presented in this proof. If you want to make any changes, please correct the details now. Note that corrections after publication will no longer be possible.	is ok	
AU2	Please confirm if identified footnotes are okay.	ok	
AU3	Strauss (1998) has been changed to Strauss (1989) as per references list. Please check if okay.	ok	
AU4	Please check if formatting for Tables 1 and 2 are okay.	ok	
AU5	Please confirm if inserted citation of Tables 1 and 2 are okay.	ok	
AU6	Please cite MacAulay and Lawton (2003) in the text.	can be removed	
AU7	Please provinis paper deaitorth Blok (2019).	coming' in the journal 'Philo	sophy of m
AU8	Please provide volume of Deslandes (2018).	this paper is in press and r	ot assigne

Note:

If you are using material from other works please make sure that you have obtained the necessary permission from the copyright holders and that references to the original publications are included.