

# **Studies in Applied Philosophy, Epistemology and Rational Ethics**

Volume 43

## **Series editor**

Lorenzo Magnani, University of Pavia, Pavia, Italy  
e-mail: [lmagnani@unipv.it](mailto:lmagnani@unipv.it)

## **Editorial Board**

Atocha Aliseda  
Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México (UNAM), Coyoacan, Mexico

Giuseppe Longo  
Centre Cavailles, CNRS—Ecole Normale Supérieure, Paris, France

Chris Sinha  
School of Foreign Languages, Hunan University, Changsha, P.R. China

Paul Thagard  
Waterloo University, Waterloo, ON, Canada

John Woods  
University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada

Studies in Applied Philosophy, Epistemology and Rational Ethics (SAPERE) publishes new developments and advances in all the fields of philosophy, epistemology, and ethics, bringing them together with a cluster of scientific disciplines and technological outcomes: from computer science to life sciences, from economics, law, and education to engineering, logic, and mathematics, from medicine to physics, human sciences, and politics. It aims at covering all the challenging philosophical and ethical themes of contemporary society, making them appropriately applicable to contemporary theoretical, methodological, and practical problems, impasses, controversies, and conflicts. The series includes monographs, lecture notes, selected contributions from specialized conferences and workshops as well as selected Ph.D. theses.

### **Advisory Board**

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| A. Abe, Chiba, Japan                          | A. Pereira, São Paulo, Brazil               |
| H. Andersen, Copenhagen, Denmark              | L. M. Pereira, Caparica, Portugal           |
| O. Bueno, Coral Gables, USA                   | A.-V. Pietarinen, Helsinki, Finland         |
| S. Chandrasekharan, Mumbai, India             | D. Portides, Nicosia, Cyprus                |
| M. Dascal, Tel Aviv, Israel                   | D. Provijsn, Ghent, Belgium                 |
| G. D. Crnkovic, Göteborg, Sweden              | J. Queiroz, Juiz de Fora, Brazil            |
| M. Ghins, Lovain-la-Neuve, Belgium            | A. Raftopoulos, Nicosia, Cyprus             |
| M. Guarini, Windsor, Canada                   | C. Sakama, Wakayama, Japan                  |
| R. Gudwin, Campinas, Brazil                   | C. Schmidt, Le Mans, France                 |
| A. Heeffter, Ghent, Belgium                   | G. Schurz, Dusseldorf, Germany              |
| M. Hildebrandt, Rotterdam,<br>The Netherlands | N. Schwartz, Buenos Aires, Argentina        |
| K. E. Himma, Seattle, USA                     | C. Shelley, Waterloo, Canada                |
| M. Hoffmann, Atlanta, USA                     | F. Stjernfelt, Aarhus, Denmark              |
| P. Li, Guangzhou, P.R. China                  | M. Suarez, Madrid, Spain                    |
| G. Minnameier, Frankfurt, Germany             | J. van den Hoven, Delft,<br>The Netherlands |
| M. Morrison, Toronto, Canada                  | P.-P. Verbeek, Enschede,<br>The Netherlands |
| Y. Ohsawa, Tokyo, Japan                       | R. Viale, Milan, Italy                      |
| S. Paavola, Helsinki, Finland                 | M. Vorms, Paris, France                     |
| W. Park, Daejeon, South Korea                 |   |

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/10087>

Woosuk Park

# Philosophy's Loss of Logic to Mathematics

An Inadequately Understood Take-Over

 Springer

Woosuk Park  
Humanities and Social Sciences  
KAIST  
Daejeon, Korea (Republic of)

ISSN 2192-6255                      ISSN 2192-6263 (electronic)  
Studies in Applied Philosophy, Epistemology and Rational Ethics  
ISBN 978-3-319-95146-1              ISBN 978-3-319-95147-8 (eBook)  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-95147-8>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018947027

© Springer International Publishing AG, part of Springer Nature 2018

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer International Publishing AG part of Springer Nature

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

# Preface

Essays originally published in Korean have been translated into English by me. I have made small changes, mainly stylistic, to most of the articles published internationally. In updating the book's chapter, I have striven for an overall consistency and coherence, I hope with satisfactory success. Supplementary readings are proposed in the Epilogue.

Chapter 2 first appeared in Korean in *Yonsei Philosophy*, 4, (1992), 53–80. Chapter 3 is a reprint of a paper published in *Modern Schoolman*, Vol. 67, (1990), 259–273. Chapter 4 appeared in *Logica Yearbook 2000*, (Prague: Czech Academy of Science), (2001), pp. 79–89. Chapter 5 appeared in *Korean Journal of Logic*, 11. 2, (2008), 1–57. Chapter 6 was published in *Erkenntnis*, 76 (3), (2012), 427–442. Chapter 7 was published in *Korean Journal of Logic*, 14.2, (2011), 1–37. Chapter 8 appeared in *Korean Journal of Logic*, 17 (1), (2014), 33–69. Chapter 9 was published as a discussion note in *Modern Schoolman*, Vol. 80, (2003), 144–153. Chapter 10 was published in *Korean Journal of Logic*, 9.2, (2006), 117–175. Chapter 11 was published in *Foundations of Science*, 21, (2016), 511–526. Chapter 12 was published (in English) in *Korean Journal of Logic*, 12.2, (2009), 141–170.

Daejeon, Korea (Republic of)

Woosuk Park

## **Acknowledgements**

While I am indebted to all my teachers in logic and philosophy, I am especially grateful to Jorge J. E. Garcia and John Corcoran for their unfailing support. Nino Cocchiarella's detailed and much appreciated comments led to invaluable improvements of several of the book's chapters. As always, I have benefited from the criticism and encouragement of John Woods and Lorenzo Magnani.

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
	References .....	6
<b>Part I The Fregean Legacy</b>		
<b>2</b>	<b>Frege’s Distinction Between “Falling Under” and “Subordination”</b> .....	9
1	Introduction .....	9
2	The Distinction .....	10
3	The Non-existence of the Distinction .....	12
	3.1 Traditional Logic .....	12
	3.2 19th Century Mathematicians .....	18
4	Why Does the Distinction Matter to Frege? .....	23
	4.1 In Search of Logical Objects .....	24
	4.2 Frege’s Analysis of the Statements of Number .....	25
	4.3 Frege’s Function-Correlates .....	26
	4.4 The Distinction Between Falling Under and Subordination Versus the Distinction Between Class Membership and Class Inclusion .....	27
	References .....	28
<b>3</b>	<b>Scotus, Frege, and Bergmann</b> .....	31
1	Cocchiarella’s Thesis .....	33
2	Scotus and Frege .....	34
3	Bergmann and Frege .....	39
4	Scotus and Bergmann .....	42
	References .....	44

<b>4</b>	<b>On Cocchiarella's Retroactive Theory of Reference</b> . . . . .	47
1	Introduction . . . . .	47
2	Predicable Concepts and Nominalized Predicates . . . . .	49
3	Referential Concepts . . . . .	51
3.1	General Reference . . . . .	51
3.2	Singular Reference of Proper Names . . . . .	52
4	Frege and Cocchiarella . . . . .	53
5	Conclusion . . . . .	55
	References . . . . .	56
<b>Part II The Hilbert School</b>		
<b>5</b>	<b>Zermelo and the Axiomatic Method</b> . . . . .	59
1	Introduction . . . . .	59
2	The Discrepancy Between the Later Zermelo's Thought and Hilbert Program . . . . .	62
3	The Development of Hilbert's Thought on Axiomatic Method Between 1900 and 1917 . . . . .	63
3.1	Implicit Definition in Hilbert . . . . .	64
3.2	Euclidean Axiom System and Hilbertian Axiomatic Method: Unending Frege/Hilbert Controversy . . . . .	64
3.3	The Application of the Axiomatic Method and Deepening the Foundations . . . . .	67
3.4	The Influence of Zermelo-Russell Paradox . . . . .	71
4	Zermelo's Position on the Axiomatic Method Around 1908 . . . . .	74
4.1	The Motivations for the Axiomatization . . . . .	74
4.2	Zermelo's Reductionism . . . . .	76
4.3	The Problem of Selecting Axioms and the Axiom of Choice . . . . .	78
4.4	Could Zermelo's Axiomatic System of Set Theory Be the Implicit Definition of the Concept of Set? . . . . .	82
5	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	84
	References . . . . .	84
<b>6</b>	<b>Friedman on Implicit Definition: In Search of the Hilbertian Heritage in Philosophy of Science</b> . . . . .	87
1	Introduction . . . . .	87
2	Implicit Definition and the Relativized a Priori . . . . .	89
3	Carnap's Debt to Hilbert . . . . .	94
3.1	Hilbert on Deepening the Foundations . . . . .	95
3.2	Friedman on Carnap's Later Views on Theoretical Terms in Science . . . . .	98
4	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	99
	References . . . . .	100



**7 Between Bernays and Carnap** . . . . . 103

1 Introduction . . . . . 103

2 Hilbert’s Axiomatic Method and Deepening the Foundations . . . . . 106

3 The Limitation of Hilbert’s Axiomatic Method from Bernays’  
Point of View . . . . . 108

3.1 The Development of Axiomatic Method . . . . . 108

3.2 The Problem of Uniformity of the Axiomatic Method . . . . . 112

4 Bernays’ Criticism of Carnap . . . . . 115

5 Concluding Remarks . . . . . 117

References . . . . . 118

**Part III Goedel and Tarski**

**8 Patterson on Tarski’s Definition of Logical Consequence** . . . . . 123

1 Introduction . . . . . 123

2 Patterson’s Interpretation of Tarski . . . . . 128

2.1 Intuitionistic Formalism and the Young Tarski . . . . . 129

2.2 Skepticism About Semantics . . . . . 133

2.3 Carnap and Tarski . . . . . 136

2.4 Carnap’s and Tarski’s Concepts of Logical Consequence . . . 137

3 Beyond Patterson . . . . . 140

References . . . . . 143

**9 On the Motivations of Gödel’s Ontological Proof** . . . . . 145

1 Introduction . . . . . 145

2 Back to Gödel’s Original Proof . . . . . 146

3 Gathering Clues . . . . . 147

4 The Role of the Proof of the Existence of God in Mathematics  
and Science . . . . . 150

5 Conclusion . . . . . 153

References . . . . . 153

**Part IV Back to Aristotle**

**10 Ontological Regress of Maddy’s Mathematical Naturalism** . . . . . 157

1 Introduction . . . . . 157

2 Maddy as Realist . . . . . 160

2.1 Maddy’s Strategy as a Realist to Meet Benacerraf’s  
Challenge . . . . . 160

2.2 The Analogy Between Science and Mathematics . . . . . 161

2.3 Aristotelian Aspects of Maddy’s Realism . . . . . 166

3 Maddy’s Mathematical Naturalism: Beyond Quine and Gödel . . . . 166

    3.1 What Is Gone, What Is Newly Introduced,  
        and What Is Revised. . . . . 166

    3.2 The Analogy Between Science and Mathematics  
        Revisited . . . . . 169

4 Concluding Remarks: What Maddy’s Belief Change Means . . . . . 185

References . . . . . 185

**11 What if Haeceity Is not a Property?** . . . . . 189

    1 Introduction . . . . . 189

    2 The Common Assumptions About Haeceity . . . . . 191

    3 Haeceity and the Identity of Indiscernibles . . . . . 192

    4 *Haeceitas* from Scotus’ Point of View . . . . . 196

    5 What if Haeceity Is not a Property? . . . . . 199

    6 Concluding Remarks . . . . . 202

    References . . . . . 205

**12 Biancani on *Scientiae Mediae*** . . . . . 207

    1 Introduction . . . . . 207

    2 Wallace and Dear on the Motivations of Jesuit Debates  
        on *Scientiae Mediae* . . . . . 208

    3 The Chapter on *Scientiae Mediae* . . . . . 210

    4 Biancani’s Target . . . . . 211

    5 Biancani on Perfect Demonstrations . . . . . 212

    6 Biancani’s Strategy . . . . . 217

    7 Concluding Remarks . . . . . 219

    References . . . . . 220

**Epilogue** . . . . . 223

**References** . . . . . 229