

a word, and to get full information of the extent of that use in different kinds of writing, and at different periods, and of its relation to other uses. A notable feature is the short sketch of the history of a word with which the more important articles end.

English scholars will, I am sure, congratulate the editor on the excellence of his work, and wish him good speed.

W. E. P. PANTIN.

St. Paul's School, West Kensington, W.

Quellen und Forschungen zur Alten Geschichte und Geographie. Von W. SIEGLIN. Heft 25: Dr. Hans Philipp, *Die historisch-geographischen Quellen in den 'etymologiae' des Isidorus von Sevilla.* Teil I. Berlin: Weidmannsche Buchhandlung, 1912. 1 vol. 8vo. Pp. 90. M. 3.

THIS is the first of two volumes in which Dr. Philipp gives the result of his researches into the sources used by Isidore of Seville in *Libri xx originum sive etymologiarum*. Isidore had in an extreme degree the craving for making compilations, and the *etymologiae* is his masterpiece in this art. Many of the sources from which he quoted do not now exist in their entirety, but they may be partly reconstructed by means of the

passages that Isidore has preserved. Herein lies the value of a detailed analysis of the text of Isidore's work.

Dr. Philipp deals only with the geographical sections of the *etymologiae*. His task was the more difficult because ancient geographers were generally content to copy their facts from previous writers. New information at first hand was rare, and so we have the statements of Pytheas for Britain, of Pytheas and Polybius for the coast of Spain, of other voyagers for other regions, repeated century after century. It is not easy to determine, therefore, the ultimate source of any statement. Dr. Philipp has had to content himself for the most part with giving the immediate sources, though he has wherever possible mentioned ultimate sources as well.

Dr. Philipp's method of exposition is clear. He finds quoted in the *etymologiae* the works of some fifty writers. He takes each of these in turn, gives a list of the passages quoted and a reference to the place in the *etymologiae* where the quotation is to be found. The simplicity of the result tends to conceal the amount of work that Dr. Philipp has done in dealing with hundreds of passages, but he deserves the gratitude of all future workers in this field.

A. J. B. GREEN.

98, Hills Road, Cambridge.

CORRESPONDENCE

To the Editors of THE CLASSICAL REVIEW.
VIRGILIVS MARO.

I AM very grateful to Mr. Warde Fowler for his grave consideration of my paper 'Marones' and for 'the spirit of fraternal love of learning and loyalty to truth' which animates his gentle indictment. I have no wish to convert or persuade anyone to my views to whom they do not at once commend themselves by their transparent truth. They can bide their time, and wait contentedly the coming of their appointed day of acceptance; but it would be discourteous to my friendly critic if I were to ignore objections so graciously unfolded.

Owing doubtless to my imperfect power of expression, he has not quite caught my meaning in a most important point. He is mistaken in thinking that I said that Virgil 'had persuaded himself that he was priest of Apollo' or 'fancied

himself a priest,' except perhaps on one occasion in a vision; but I showed that in his poems, for whatever reason, he consciously, and without any illusion, adopted the part of a minister of Apollo—'Phoebi uates.' Nor did I speak of 'his belief in his Thracian ancestors,' but explained how such an idea, discernable in his Thraceward leanings, might naturally have occurred to him in connection with his own name: started perhaps in gentle banter, it soon seemed to become the source of his highest inspiration. The words 'priest' and 'priesthood' were used by me figuratively and theologically rather than literally and ceremonially. No question of communion between Greek and Latin Church. Perhaps in these days a self-dedicated, hereditary, court or domestic chaplain would have come nearer to my meaning. Nor did I knowingly suggest any rôle for Apollo in the *Aeneid* weightier than is already demon-

strably there. I neither said nor thought anything derogatory to the supreme majesty of Jupiter: to have done so would have been irreverent and irrelevant. The greatness of Jupiter or the alleged littleness of Apollo have nothing to do with my contention that Virgil by hint and allusion was bent in some mysterious way on identifying Augustus with Apollo. Furthermore, there are my sins of omission. There is a suggestion of lines not quoted that would have told against me.

They were left out from a desire to be brief and to avoid repeating explanations already given by me in the *Classical Review* for March, 1908—'Gods in the *Eclogues*.' If they had been quoted in full they would have strengthened, and not weakened, my cause.

The view presented in 'Marones' is based upon Virgil's unique power of using language in such a way as to convey, when he pleases, far more than the simple meaning of his words, which thus bear not only an obvious and primary sense for the many readers, but also a secondary occult sense for the few or the one—for the inner circle of the friends of Augustus or for Augustus himself. Most of us mean only what we say: Virgil often much more than he says. This way of his in the *Eclogues* was made clear by me four years ago. Recently finding that the Maronian key opened other secret drawers, I extended its use to the *Georgics* and *Aeneid* as well as to the *Eclogues*.

In *Ecl.* 4, Apollo, as the sun-god, is definitely pronounced to be the reigning deity of the new Golden Age ('tuus jam regnat Apollo') which was started under the administration of Augustus, who is joyfully hailed by the Sibyl, the mouth-piece of Apollo, as 'Cara deum suboles, magnum louis incrementum!' He was the only person of the required pedigree, and from that time forward, whenever the Golden Age is alluded to, Augustus and Apollo are not far off. In the invocation (*Georg.* 1) it is true, as Mr. Warde Fowler says, that Apollo is not named, but one would expect him, as the sun-god so important to agriculture, to come first and last, and in line 5, *Georg.* 1, 5, one of the 'clarissima mundi | Lumina.'

The long address, *Georg.* 1, 24-47 ('Tuque adeo'), asking Augustus what heavenly title or province he was about to assume, is clearly all light banter intended to lead up to the friendly and solemn warning not to take the title of king—for even thinking of which Julius Caesar had been assassinated (*Georg.* 1, 36 and 37).

Quidquid eris (nam te nec sperent Tartara regem,

Nec tibi regnandi ueniat tam dira cupido).

Virgil says take any title you like, but leave kingship alone. Whatever you become, do not say—like the Homeric sun-god (*Odys.* 12, 383)—that you will descend to Hades and shine among the dead, nor feel such unnatural yearning to be king. Do not say: *Δύσομαι εἰς Αἴδαο καὶ ἐν νεκῆσσι φαείνω*, but be our sun-god here, and help me.

By no other interpretation can any point be given to these two lines.

No one need look in this or any other passage

for the name or title Augustus-Apollo. It is a mere coinage of my own, to express the union of the two which underlies the mention of one. Take, for instance, line 500 in this same *Georg.*, where Virgil returns to the good government to be expected from Augustus (and the Golden Age). He prays the gods of his country:

Hunc saltem euerso iuuenem succurrere saeclo
Ne prohibete. Satis jam pridem sanguine
nostro

Laomedontae luimus perjuria Trojae.

(A special appeal to Apollo.)

Jam pridem nobis caeli te regia, Caesar,
Inuidet, atque hominum queritur curare triumphos.

I interpret this roughly as: 'Prevent not, ye gods (as you did in the case of Julius Caesar), this youth, at least from saving our age from ruin. Long since have we paid with our blood the price of Laomedon's attempt to deprive Apollo, when he last dwelt on earth, of his minimum wage for building the walls of Troy. Hasten, Caesar, heaven's palace has long been grudging us your absence from their banqueting halls (during your mission on earth to reintroduce the Golden Age), and all complaint of your caring for petty human triumphs in a wicked world (when you ought to be playing accompaniments to the singing of the Muses in the courts of Olympus. The line 'Laomedontae luimus perjuria Trojae' is pointless unless taken as I interpret it.

Virgil here mentions Augustus Caesar, and skilfully alludes to his identity with Apollo. He renders to Caesar not only the things that are Caesar's, but also the things that are God's. As a poet he would wish to be plain and intelligible; as enthusiastic Court Chaplain to Augustus-Apollo he had good reason to be more circumspect. As the world-poet he spoke to all for all time: as priest he spoke to a few, perhaps to only one of his own contemporaries, as to day he speaks apparently only to one.

In the opening passage of *Georg.* 3, Virgil says in brief: 'We will sing of Pales and of Apollo, once keeper of sheep on earth. The old mythological subjects of song are worn out. I must find a new way to rise as poet-conqueror. To do this I will bring the Muses to Mantua, and will build them a marble temple on the Mincius. In the centre of all will be (not the old Apollo of the worn-out mythology, but my new Apollo) my Caesar, and will hold the temple. I, a poet-conqueror, a pious founder of a new religion, fresh comer from Edom, in dyed garments from Bozra (D.Litt. and D.D.) will set in motion chariot races and Olympian games, bring priestly offerings, head processions, watch the slaying of bullocks (the proper Apolline victims—no need to go beyond the Sibyl, *Aen.* 6, 38, or Helenus, *Aen.* 3, 369, or *Aen.* 8, 719, for this), and see to other details about the temple doors, and statues of Julian ancestors, and a statue of the old Apollo ('Trojae Cynthus auctor'). No trace of Jupiter here any more than at the twelve gods' fancy-dress banquet, when Augustus Apollo was in the chair. No trace here of consul or golden crown, or toga picta, or tunica palmata, or other paraphernalia

of military triumph. The olive crown and the sacrifices suggest Numa, founder of a new religion, and the purple raiment a priest-king (*Aen.* 6, 809): 'Quis procul ille autem ramis insignia oliuae Sacra ferens?' This was no military Roman triumph proceeding to the Capitol. The scene was the Mincian Plain. A hundred four-in-hand chariots were more than Virgil would need to ride in as a literary and religious or even sporting conqueror. Ninety-nine were clearly for racing.

In Virgil's imaginary festival the place of Augustus would be on the threshold, or in the vestibule of the temple, whence he could see his own pageant, and be seen, as in *Aen.* 8, 720. In the cella would be the statue of Apollo: perhaps the identical statue made to order in the likeness of Apollo after the twelve gods' fancy dress dinner. The breathing statue ('signum spirans') in the cella, the breathing god on the threshold. The above vision finds its fulfilment in *Aen.* 8, 719 and 720 ('Ipse sedens niueo candentis limine Phoebi Dona recognoscit populorum'), where the truth is out, and the temple is no longer called the temple of Caesar, but of Phoebus. The Muses from Parnassus may have been ultimately accommodated in the library attached to the actual temple. Nor must the first glimmer of the Golden Age, predicted as coming under the auspices of Apollo and Augustus, remain unnoted in this passage (*Georg.* 3, 37-39). The pointed relegation of malignant hate or envy to the tortures of hell was a necessary preliminary towards the good government heralded in *Ecl.* 4, carried further in *Aen.* 1, and finding complete fulfilment in *Aen.* 6 and 8.

Before passing to the prophecies of *Aen.* 1 and 6, and their fulfilment in *Aen.* 8, it may be well to take one or two isolated points. Mr. Warde Fowler duly notes that when the succession from Aeneas, through which Apollo was to be born again as god of the Golden Age, was in danger, it was Jupiter who sent Mercury, the Olympian College messenger, to Aeneas, directing him to break off with Dido; but he fails to note that Apollo had been before him, and ordered the Trojan chief to Italy (*Aen.* 4, 345 and 346):

Sed nunc Italiam magnam Gryneus Apollo,
Italiam Lyciae iussere capessere sortes.

'Nunc augur Apollo, Nunc Lyciae sortes' (*Aen.* 4, 376) says the scornful Dido. And when the succession was again imperilled by the over-daring of Iulus in Italy, Apollo alone, contrary to his wont, directly intervened to stop him fighting (*Aen.* 9, 638-696, especially 642 and 656), 'Cetera parce, puer, bello.' because Iulus was 'begotten of gods, and destined to beget gods' (*Aen.* 9, 642): 'Dis genite, et geniture deos,' Who were they if not Augustus and Apollo?

Mr. Warde Fowler thinks that Virgil cannot have deified Augustus because he was the anti-type of Aeneas: but he did raise Aeneas to the stars (*Aen.* 1, 259); and he does liken Aeneas to Apollo (*Aen.* 4, 143), in a very beautiful simile, obviously intended to suggest a transfigured Augustus when the latter went into winter quar-

ters at Samos after the battle of Actium. It is not necessary to maintain that Augustus even touched at or visited Delos, or himself instituted morris-dances on Mount Cynthus in commemoration of Actium as he probably did. The picturesque pilgrims described in the simile may have spontaneously exhibited their joy by a ceremonial mountain-dance, at which Apollo or Augustus would be represented (*Aen.* 4, 143-149):

Qualis ubi *hibernam* Lyciam Xanthique fluenta
Deserit, ac Delum maternam inuisit Apollo,
Cretesque Dryopesque fremunt pictique Aga-
thyrsi:

Ipse jugis Cynthi graditur, mollique fluentem
Fronde premit crinem fingens, atque implicat
auro;

Tela sonant humeris.

(Suet. Aug. 18) Ab Actio quum Samum *in hiberna* se recepisset.

I pass to the first prophecy (*Aen.* 1, 260) and concede to Mr. Warde Fowler that out of about thirty-five lines only twelve refer directly to Augustus. They refer to his deification and worship, and the beginning of the Golden Age. It came slowly; and in *Georg.* 1, 500 seemed almost to have come to a standstill. Hence Virgil's prayer to the gods not to hinder Augustus from saving the age; and his appeal to Apollo to forego further vengeance, because the compensation for the fraud of Laomedon was now complete. In *Georg.* 3 there is better hope. After the mention of Trojan Apollo, Envious Hate, or Malignity, the curse of government is sent to Hell; and in *Aen.* 1, 291 the Golden Age again appears upon the horizon ('Asperatum positis mitescent saecula bellis'); good government of patricians and plebeian united will prevail. The gates of war will be closed. Madness of civil strife will be bound in chains, and tortured. Augustus is named as the usher-in of this age of peace.

Turn now to *Aen.* 6, 792:

Hic uir, hic est, tibi quem promitti saepius audis,
Augustus Caesar, Dium genus: aurea condet
Saecula qui rursus Latio, regnata per arua
Saturno quondam;

Again, 799-801:

Hujus in aduentum jam nunc et Caspia regna
Responsis horrent diuum, et Maeotia tellus,
Et septemgemini turbant trepida ostia Nili.

'This is he,' says the Sibyl, 'so often promised you—Augustus Caesar of race divine. He will re-establish the Golden Age in Latium, the land once reigned over by Saturn (now by Apollo); and his coming will be heralded by cosmical emotion and dread oracles of gods in the near East, and trepidation of all the mouths of Nile.' As conqueror he will surpass Hercules and Bacchus. This is clearly the fulfilment of *Ecl.* 4, showing beyond all question that Augustus was the subject of that poem:

Aspice conuexo nutantem pondere mundum,
Terrasque, tractusque maris, coelumque pro-
fundum;

Aspice, uenturo laetantur ut omnia saeclo!

The cosmical emotion and Sibylline prophecies seem to be the same as those of *Ecl.* 4, of the

Old Testament, and Septuagint, here assigned to Alexandria, and afterwards there appropriated for Vespasian (*Tac. Hist.* 2). Is all this the coming of a mere man? At the moment of the Sibyl's indication he was not even that; he was an unborn ghost, and the words are used demonstratively:

Mighty Seaman, this is he
Was great by land as thou by sea.

In any case it cannot be maintained that because he was a man before he was born, he could not be a god before he died. In this very passage (*Aen.* 6) Virgil gives three tokens of divinity; the restoration of the Golden Age, as in *Ecl.* 4—the cosmical emotion manifested before his coming—unusual in the case of a mere man; the placing him as a conqueror over the head of gods in divine achievement.

Though Mr. Warde Fowler thinks there is no passage in the *Aeneid* which can be taken as treating Augustus Caesar as god, I seem to see the august sign-manual of divinity also in *Aen.* 8, 680 and 681:

geminas cui tempora flammæ
Laeta uomunt, patriumque aperitur uertice sidus.

(His joyous temples shoot forth twin flames,
and his paternal star is made manifest above

his head), which suggests to me a nimbus of volcanic activity, or the dazzling flames of the sun-god (Velleius Paterculus, Book 2), rather than the polished helmet of a mere man: the star, a star as of Bethlehem. Actian Apollo draws his bow: Augustus Caesar triumphs. Before the altars the ground is strewn with slain bullocks, the proper Apollinarian victims as in *Aen.* 6, 37; *Georg.* 3, 27; *Aen.* 3, and *Aen.* 8, 720, and elsewhere. Caesar himself, seated on the snowy threshold of the temple of gleaming Phoebus (the proper place for the god at the celebration of his own pageant, wishing to see his own show), surveys the offerings of the nations (*Suet. Cal.* 22, 42. Caligula as god took his stand in the vestibule of his own temple to receive worshippers and New Year's gift-givers).

The battle of Actium, won by Apollo and Augustus, was the real fulfilment of Virgil's dream of a Golden Age and good government and universal peace. It is objected that anyone might read through Virgil without guessing that there was any special connection between the god Apollo and the poet. That was why I wrote 'Marones,' and why, for Mr. Warde Fowler's sake, I write this.

R. W. RAPER.

NOTES AND NEWS

WE offer our heartiest felicitations to the University of Manchester on the establishment of a new Chair of Imperial Latin. Such an act is infinitely creditable both to the largemindedness of the University Council and to the energy and capacity of the teachers who have prepared the way by fostering Latin studies,—studies traditionally associated with Manchester ever since the days of Professor Wilkins. 'It may be claimed,' says the writer of a leading article in the *Times* of May 2, 'that no other single subject can in a superior degree contribute a vital element of greatness to the education of an imperial race.' That is most true. It is not necessary for the *Classical Review* to dwell on the importance of the study of Imperial Latin: suffice it to say that we associate ourselves heartily with the *Times* when it congratulates the University on having risen in this matter to the height of its responsibility towards the nation.'

The writer of the above-quoted article argues—naturally enough—that the situation ought to give pause to advocates of 'compulsory Greek.' Latin is

optional at Manchester: yet see how it flourishes, even to the requirement of new Professorships! That is a very obvious debating point. Adherents of an unpopular cause might perhaps reply that Professorships are the outcome of a demand on the part of a more and more highly intensified study—the increasing enthusiasm of a necessarily small band of specialists: and that while everyone rejoices that there should be such a demand, it is possible to hope that 'compulsion' might help to preserve a totally different thing, also good in its way—the diffusion of some sort of classical culture among those who can never be specialists or savants.

The senate of the University of Wales has recently had under review the regulations affecting the position of Latin and Greek (*a*) at Matriculation and (*b*) in Degree courses. Opinion on the whole question was sharply divided; but in the end a compromise was reached and recommendations to the following effect were sent up to the University Court:

Latin at the Matriculation stage to be obligatory, as before, on all students